

Jan-2019

The Trade and Gender Nexus in Pakistan

Maryam Tanwir

Richard Sidebottom

Follow this and additional works at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws>

 Part of the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Tanwir, Maryam and Sidebottom, Richard (2019). The Trade and Gender Nexus in Pakistan. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 20(2), 129-150.

Available at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws/vol20/iss2/10>

“Now You See Me, Now You Don’t”: Visibility in the Trade, Employment and Gender Nexus in Pakistan

By Maryam Tanwir¹ and Richard Sidebottom²

Abstract

Contemporary trade policy has been driven by an apparent consensus regarding the employment-related benefits of economic openness and export-led growth that often ignores their dispersion by sector and gender. Whilst trade may be an enabling mechanism for the most capable workers in formal sectors, it may also exclude or relegate others to less visible informal workplaces.

To appreciate the processes and perceptions underlying these differential outcomes, this research paper investigates the stories of Pakistani women as workers, farmers and entrepreneurs across a range of economic sectors. Through this lens we supplement the literature that focuses on the structure of trade and the economy by the thoughts of female participants themselves.

We identify systematic but often hidden obstacles to female employment and entrepreneurial opportunities across the entire socioeconomic spectrum. These include visible issues (such as capacity building) as well as less but equally important visible ones (such as implicit institutional bias). We find these are manifest not only in terms of human capacity building but effective capacity utilisation. This paper thereby offers insights into the complexities of gender-related aspects of employment and trade.

Keywords: Trade, Agriculture, Employment, Informal Economy, Gender Bias, Gender Neutrality, Social Downgrading

¹ Dr. Maryam Tanwir is an affiliated lecturer at the Centre of development studies, Cambridge, and runs the Gender and development course for the MPhil development studies. Her recent research and professional responsibilities have focused on International development, politics of governance and gender relations. She has worked as gender consultant for the World Bank for the Pakistan Trade and Investment policy program. Prior to that she worked as an evaluation consultant for the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), Rome, Italy. She also worked as a gender consultant for the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), in Rome, Italy. The work focused on evaluation of the development initiatives of these organizations with a focus on gender, poverty, institutional efficiency and economic growth. Prior to her PhD she worked as urban economist for government of Punjab, in Pakistan. She has also worked as a research associate for the Anti-Money Laundering Project for the World Bank.

² Dr. Richard Sidebottom is an affiliated lecturer at the Centre of Development Studies, Cambridge, and teaches in African Studies, Development Studies, Land Economy and the Institute of Continuing Education. His research interests include rural development, entrepreneurship, agricultural commodity markets and renewable energy in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia. Richard is a research consultant on the TIGR²ESS (Transforming India's Green Revolution by Research and Empowerment for Sustainable food Supplies) research project funded by the Global Challenges Research Fund. He holds a PhD and MPhil in Development Studies from the University of Cambridge, an MSc in Finance from London Business School and an MA in History and Economics from the University of Oxford. Prior to Cambridge, Richard worked for over 20 years as an emerging markets fund manager in London and Singapore.

Introduction

Pakistan's dependence on low value-added textile and commodity exports (Sidebottom, 2017; ITC, 2018), its low ranking in global female empowerment indices (WEF, 2016) and pressure from the European Union³ have each encouraged the incorporation of gender dimensions into the country's trade liberalisation policy⁴. This reflects a growing body of literature that suggests that the gender neutrality of trade is far from axiomatic such that employment and livelihood benefits are neither maximised nor equitably distributed (Cuberes and Teignier, 2014)⁵. Policy actions targeted at including women therefore have both an instrumental economic and moral component (Duflo, 2012).

This paper examines a number of pervasive factors that underpin this gender bias through a qualitative study of Pakistani women as workers, farmers and entrepreneurs across social cohorts and economic sectors (agriculture, textiles and commerce). We highlight challenges to the improvement of gender equality via trade as perceived by labour market participants themselves.

The encouragement of trade liberalisation in the form of reduced tariffs, quotas and regulations is founded on an apparent consensus regarding the benefits of economic openness and export-led growth (Rodrik, 2007). This often relies on empirical correlations between increased trade volumes, inclusive economic growth and development capacity (Dollar and Kraay, 2004; Garlaschelli and Loffredo 2004). However, the sequencing of outcomes and direction of causation are far from self-evident as such studies frequently conflate means and ends (Chang, 2002; Rodrik, 2007; Balamoune-Lutz, 2007).

In the absence of sufficient gender disaggregated data, policy makers presume rather than demonstrate that trade is 'gender neutral' (Maclaren, 2012)⁶. They rely on the assumption that improved macroeconomic metrics necessarily equate with increased equal employment opportunities and sustainable livelihood outcomes for men and women alike. Trade may be an important enabler of female agency through its growth potential and positive spill overs (Dollar, 1992, Sachs and Warner, 1995), but the impact of trade liberalisation in terms of employment and livelihood opportunities is not necessarily equal across sector, group or individual (Gibb, 2003; Wamboye and Seguino, 2014). The key research question is to understand the mechanisms by which these differential impacts occur.

Gender dimensions have been examined through female paid and unpaid work and the impact of the expansion of trade (Elson, Evers and Gideon 1997, Wamboye and Seguino, 2014). Research has increasingly suggested that women are more affected by the negative side effects of trade liberalisation. Not only are they constrained in the realisation of the positive opportunities it affords but may in fact be further pushed into the informal economy⁷. Research in Karachi and

³ These gender equality objectives form part of the European Union mandated Generalized System of Preferences (GSP) Plus status for Pakistan. The GSP facilitates vulnerable developing countries to pay fewer or no duties on exports to the EU, giving them vital access to the EU market and contributing to their growth.

⁴ Reflecting the European Union's requirements under the Generalised System of Preferences (GSP) Plus status for Pakistan. The eligibility criteria for GSP+ specify that the beneficiary country shall sign, ratify and implement 27 specified international conventions pertaining to Human Rights, Labour Rights (the eight ILO Core Conventions regarding forced labour, child labour, freedom of association and collective bargaining and discrimination), Environment, Narcotics and Good Governance.

⁵ Cuberes and Teignier (2014) estimate that the positive impact of women's participation could boost Pakistan's GDP by almost 30 percent.

⁶ Recent research by UNCTAD (2016) suggests that the effects of trade on male and female workers are not only ambiguous but frequently double-edged, as female workers may simultaneously gain and lose.

⁷ UNCTAD (2009). Mainstreaming gender in trade policy. Note by the UNCTAD secretariat. TD/B/C.I/EM.2/2/Rev.1, http://www.unctad.org/en/docs/ciem2d2_en.pdf

Lahore suggests that female empowerment and livelihood enhancement is directly linked to the degree of formality of female employment (Shaheed, Farida, and Khawar Mumtaz, 1981; Sathar, Zeba and Shahnaz Kazi, 1990).

Trade affects men and women differently due in part to specific gender roles ascribed by society within specific sectors or the concentration of female employment across sectors (Fontana, Joekes and Masika 1998; UNCTAD, 2009; Tanwir and Safdar, 2013). As men and women are not represented equally in all sectors or in all roles within sectors (World Bank, 2012, Çagatay, 2001)⁸, an increase in trade may decrease demand for goods or skills where traditionally women are employed. Wamboye and Seguino (2014), for example, find that men dominate high value cash export crops in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA).

In developing countries like Pakistan where females encounter extreme inequalities in skills, education and gendered divisions of labour (Hasan, 2010), adverse effects of increased trade may therefore include a widening gender wage gap, deterioration in female working conditions and the further isolation of females into the informal sector (Tran-Nguyen and Zampetti, 2004). Economic modernisation and trade liberalisation may therefore actually undermine women's livelihoods through a reinforcement of gender stereotypes in terms of economic roles (Boserup, 1970) and an exacerbation of gender inequalities (Balioune-Lutz, 2007; Brenton, Paul and Gamberoni, 2013)⁹.

To fully benefit from the potential positive dividends of trade liberalisation, economies and economic actors need to evolve and adapt. This may entail transition from soft and basic (import-competing) sectors to expanding (export) sectors. However, the reorientation of export industries towards more sophisticated and higher value-added goods remain dependent on higher-skilled and mobile labour, both areas where traditionally women have a disadvantage.

Although the distribution of employment appears to be related to economic structure does not necessarily imply that the underlying causes are entirely economic (Wamboye and Seguino, 2014). Women often have restricted occupational and geographical mobility due to structural and rigid segregations of labour markets that remain embedded in discriminatory social, political, religious and cultural norms.¹⁰ Safdar (2005) has found these structural phenomena are prevalent amongst female Pakistani farm workers whilst Mumtaz and Salway (2005) suggest geographical mobility of Pakistani women is especially limited if they are unaccompanied.

The combined effect of geographical and occupational immobility is the restriction of females' ability to move to where new jobs are located, switch to a different industrial sector in a particular location or perform new job functions within a particular firm. Women are therefore often less able to adapt to greater competition inherent in trade liberalisation as employees or entrepreneurs (UNCTAD, 2009). This can result in the sharp reversal of previously high levels of female labour force participation (ADB, 2000; UNCTAD, 2010).

Female labour force representation in the informal sector in general and low skilled tasks in particular is disproportionately high in Pakistan (Begum and Yasmeen, 2011). Pakistani women tend to be less skilled due to discrimination in access to education, training, time poverty, dual responsibilities and social expectations (Tanwir and Safdar, 2013). As skilled workers command a wage premium in the developed and developing world (Klein et al., 2013) and skills are

⁸ For detailed explanation please see: World Bank (2012), Gender differences in employment and why they matter, Chapter 5, siteresources.worldbank.org/INTWDR2012/Resources/7778105.../chapter-5.pdf

⁹ For detailed information please see: Brenton, Paul, and Elisa Gamberoni (2013) "Women and Trade in Africa: Realizing the Potential, Department of Economic Policy and Poverty Reduction Programs Africa" 82520.

¹⁰ Women Watch, 2011: page 6.

concentrated in male workers in Pakistan (Hassan, 2010), any increase in the demand for skilled labour disproportionately benefits men.

Women consequently remain behind as the gender pay gap widens even if there is an increase in overall demand for high value exports (Shepherd and Stone, 2017). This gender-based occupational segregation within sectors may encourage further downgrading of women in low-skilled and low-paid jobs and a migration of jobs from the formal to the informal economy. In Pakistan trade liberalisation has therefore increased female employment but simultaneously reinforced gender divisions as female employment is concentrated in unskilled tasks. This adversely affects women in poorer households through reduced capabilities and increased workloads and income poverty (Siddiqui, 2005).

As such, economic upgrading for the firm and country as a whole translates into gender specific downgrading. This leads to increased vulnerability, exploitation and an exacerbation of working conditions of female workers. This ‘defeminisation’ of the formal manufacturing labour force observed in South-East Asia as well as Pakistan (Gereffi, 2014) in essence offsets economic upgrading in one cohort with social downgrading in another (Milberg, 2013).

This implies the need for specific gender initiatives coupled with targeted socio economic policies alongside the trade liberalisation to ensure an equitable distribution of social and economic benefits (Duflo, 2012). By integrating and fully embedding women into the formal economy, this not only narrows the gender gap but creates an added dynamism to the growth dividends of trade.

Case Study Background: Pakistan

The pervasive embeddedness of gender-based inequalities in the Pakistani socioeconomic fabric are evident in the arenas of education, health and labour markets (Siegmann and Majid, 2014). In terms of gender inequality Pakistan is ranked 143rd (of 144) countries worldwide—a long way behind South Asian peers Bangladesh (72nd) and India (87th). Although Pakistan’s female labour force participation rate of 24% has recently begun to converge towards the South Asian average of 32%, it still ranks tenth lowest out of 189 countries¹¹.

These rankings reflect the fact that less than one third of the 31 million working aged women in Pakistan are deemed economically active. Less constrained choices for male workers yield better employment and livelihood opportunities. Men monopolize lucrative sectors like trade, construction and transport (Astrid, 2007) and receive wages on average 18% higher than women (WEF, 2014¹²). According to the Labour Force Survey (LFS) in 2014-15, Pakistani women account for 11.5% of employees in the informal sector but only 3% in the formal sector¹³. Moreover, nearly two thirds of the labour force are either unpaid family helpers or low-skilled (USAID, 2013). Women are overrepresented in subsistence agriculture and garment manufacturing.

Although agriculture employs 44% of Pakistan’s labour force, it accounts for 75% of jobs for women (usually in crop production, livestock management, forestry and fisheries) but only 34.9% of men (ILO, 2013; FAO, 2015). These jobs are subject to poor working conditions¹⁴, low productivity, lower pay and greater occupational and personal insecurity. According to the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (2014), the share of women in vulnerable agricultural employment

¹¹ World Bank Development Indicators (2014).

¹² World Economic Forum, Global Gender Gap Report (2014).

¹³ The Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2014.

¹⁴ Working hours, wages, time poverty, weather conditions.

increased from 67% in 1999 to 78% in 2010 but declined to 57% for men.

These patterns are also seen in leading manufacturing sectors in Pakistan including textiles and garments¹⁵, footwear and food manufacturing. LFS 2014 data shows that the female labour force participation rate of 18.9% in manufacturing is lower than in the economy as a whole (24%) and their male counterparts (24%)¹⁶. Moreover, female jobs are concentrated in particular manufacturing activities and sectors. For example, 30 percent of textile workers are female. Textiles are a significant foreign exchange earner for Pakistan with exports exceeding USD \$13.50 billion in 2017 (ITC, 2018). However, like many developing countries, Pakistan's textile exports are largely comprised of low value-added, unskilled labour-intensive garments (Sidebottom, 2017).

The low capital and energy intensity of such activities concentrated in urban areas have rendered them attractive to female entrepreneurs and workers. However, approximately 75% of female workers are employed in the low skilled, labour intensive cutting and stitching stages. The majority are employed informally via subcontractors and paid on piece rates rather than as regular salaried employees. As informal wage rates are up to 75% lower than formal rates, female workers' earning capacities are significantly impaired (Seigman, 2004).

The mode and scale of female participation rates in the formal labour force are the outcome of various economic and social factors that interact in a complex fashion at household and macro levels. These include educational attainment, geographical mobility, fertility rates, marital age and economic growth/cyclical effects (ILO, 2013). Encompassing each of these are pervasive social norms which continue to determine the role of women in the public domain across South Asia in general and Pakistan in particular (Tanwir, 2014).

Methodology and Research Focus

In light of these phenomena, our research uses qualitative analysis of female labour force participation rates in Pakistan to suggest gender-specific means to enhance them. Our aim was to understand the mode and process of engagement, not simply analyse quantitative outcomes. The analysis centres on criteria outlined in the World Bank's Gender Equality, Poverty Reduction and Inclusive Growth Paper along with current international literature on gender and trade¹⁷.

We focus on three sectors in which female employment participation is largest: manufacturing (with a focus on textile and garments); agriculture (with a focus on cotton and rice); and female entrepreneurship in commerce¹⁸. Using the lens of the GSP Plus approach, these are examined in terms of the improvement of human endowments through removal of constraints on the quantity and quality of jobs; removal of barriers to women's ownership and control of assets;

¹⁵ The relatively concentrated portfolio of exports in Pakistan includes cotton yarn and cotton manufactures; leather; rice, chemicals and pharma products and sports goods (FAO, 2015). Textiles and agro-food products account for over 70 percent of Pakistan's export earnings. The country is the world's 4th largest producer of cotton and ranks 13th among leading textile and apparel exporters with nearly a 2% market share.

¹⁶ <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/Labour%20Force/publications/lfs2013-14/t42-pak-fin.pdf>

¹⁷ http://www.wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2016/02/23/090224b0841a382c/3_0/Rendered/PDF/World0Bank0Gro0and0inclusive0growth.pdf

¹⁸ Previous work has not addressed specific initiatives to include female workers involved in agriculture, textiles and commerce in regional trade in Pakistan. In addition, no research has taken into account the range of issues females involved in agriculture or textile experience, from the worker in the lowest tier to a seasonal farmer employed in subsistence agriculture, paid piecemeal, to insights from the few big land-holding female farmers, who compete with their male counterparts.

and the enhancement of women's voice and agency. As the combination and mixing of different research methods translates into richer results (Eisenhardt, 1989; Hargreaves et al., 2007; Howe and McKay, 2007), our study draws on multiple sources to develop a narrative enriched by direct observation.

These methods included interviews and focus groups with multiple stakeholders from numerous sectors and social cohorts. We conducted semi-structured interviews with 44 respondents representing farmers, manufacturers, consultants and labourers¹⁹. These were conducted in 2016-17 with male and female workers for triangulation and to collate first-hand information and recommendations based on personal, real life experiences in their daily lives²⁰.

Interviewees in the agriculture sector covered an array of activities including female farmers, landlords, and exporters. They included not only smallholders but also a rice exporter, a major landholder and a non-governmental organisation called Potohar Organization for Development Advocacy (PODA), which engages directly with small rural female farmers. Individual stories and perceptions of farmers provided valuable insights as they offered a nuanced evaluation of specific motivations and frustrations. Moreover, this mode of research has the potential to empower interviewees as remedies based on their own input are likely to have a greater chance of success than those imposed on them externally.

A further 8 interviews were conducted at the Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry (LCCI) to understand the challenges faced by the female entrepreneurs. These were supplemented with information derived from surveys conducted by the LCCI of their 600 registered female entrepreneurs. In addition, we used secondary data from a number of official sources (Pakistan government and international organizations such as FAO, the ILO and the World Bank).

Three questionnaires²¹ were formulated based on desk review of the current Pakistani trade situation and international best practices and distributed amongst textile workers²², entrepreneurs²³ and farm workers. The results highlighted their perceptions regarding the impediments to their effective participation in trade, possible initiatives to increase their participation, issues regarding the quantity of jobs, their functional dispersion, remuneration and quality.

Research Findings

Our key finding is that obstacles to female empowerment display common features across the sectors we examined. Patterns of occupational dispersion by sector and skill reflect framings of gender inclusion and exclusion that are shared by agriculture, textile manufacturing and

¹⁹ All the stake holders were involved in economic trade activities or were in charge of workers and projects that were engaged in trade. The women in agriculture were the farmers, landlords and also women working in PODA (all levels from chairman to assistants). The entrepreneurs referred to the females registered owners registered with the Lahore chamber of commerce.

²⁰ Please see Appendix for a list of people interviewed.

²¹ Based on the current trade scenario of Pakistan, the focus was on agriculture, textiles and information technology, the rationale being that most of the women were visibly present in these three sectors.

²² For this purpose, a detailed questionnaire was formulated and administered in Kohinoor textile mills, Islamabad. The questionnaire was informed by international and national literature, regarding the possible catalysts and impediments to female participation in textiles factories. The survey probed on removal of gender gaps by provision of training, the possibility of minimizing the wage gap, examination of the advantages their male counterparts had, how to achieve a level playing field, issues of sexual harassment, formal contracts, or lack of, child care, transport, quotas, and trade unions.

²³ The president, the director, the deputy director, the research associate and assistants were interviewed to gauge the impediments the female entrepreneurs had registered with the LCCI in terms of their participation in trade.

entrepreneurship.

Through careful and sensitive conduct of our research, we uncovered a number of themes that lay behind participation statistics. The following summarises these themes by sector before we interpret and discuss our results as a whole.

Agriculture

A feature of responses amongst farmworkers was that although they are overrepresented in agriculture, women feel unrecognized at the official level often beyond the reach of government protection²⁴: “The female farmers are everywhere but “informally!”²⁵” This cloak of invisibility confirms similar findings by Begum and Yasmeen (2011) and manifests itself in terms of access to skills, formal contracts, equitable wages, access to credit and safe work environments. It also resonates with previous research findings that rural women have poorer education and information compared to the male counterparts²⁶.

The seasonal and informal nature of women’s work on farms tends to be poorly paid despite harsh working conditions and unpredictable work allocation²⁷. This results in many women failing to improve their livelihoods despite the fact they are engaged in the labour market. As a consequence of the mode of participation, they remain wedged at the lower value end of the economy: “These women are very busy just surviving. They have no food security. No access to marketing, they have such a low presence in the local market, forget about regional market!”²⁸

The primary constraints cited by our interviewees were inadequate skills and a lack of knowledge regarding the standardisation and quality of products for export markets in particular: “If you need to connect female farmers to exports, one needs to be cognizant that exports need training. And women workers are not trained...First tell them how to produce more surplus, then how to market that surplus.”²⁹

This implies a need for more capacity building to facilitate female engagement with labour and product markets but we also learned that this was often not forthcoming: “The women are not taught business skills, they don’t have access to extension services, and there simply is no value chain addition.”³⁰

This confirms the findings of Sadaf (2005) who concluded that those farmers with the greatest need have the lowest skill and literacy levels and the worst access to the information regarding agricultural production, logistics and marketing. A lack of knowledge of customer requirements translates into a high degree of wastage and poor quality control. One interviewee cited an example of high value-added produce (strawberries) that illustrates this point:

“The female farmers send me a sample box of strawberries for testing. The sample of strawberries is always at least 70 percent wasted. It’s terrible that by the time the strawberries reach me, they are nearly finished, better not to send them and maybe make jam. Why are they wasted? Because they don’t know that they

²⁴ Conversations with focus groups, farmers, and PODA chief executive.

²⁵ Conversations with the chief executive of PODA, Ms. Sameena Nazir.

²⁶ For detailed information please see: Smith, S., Auret, D., Barrientos, S., Dolan, C., Kleinbooi, K., Njobvu, C., Opondo, M. and Tallontire, A., 2004, ‘Ethical trade in African horticulture: gender, rights and participation’, IDS Working Paper 223, Brighton: IDS, and S, Auret et al., 2004.

²⁷ Conversations with development practitioners.

²⁸ Conversations with the chief executive of PODA, Ms. Sameena Nazir.

²⁹ Rabia Sultan, Director of Farmers’ Association.

³⁰ Conversations with the chief executive of PODA, Ms. Sameena Nazir.

should pick up the strawberries earlier, a bit raw, but the women need to know that, also they need to know post-harvest technology, the women need to know how to pack them so they stay fresh, they don't know that, and then the transport on bus makes it worse."³¹

Women's capacity to improve their livelihoods is inhibited not just by poor information and training but a lack of access to cash and credit. This was not just a question of the ability to borrow money (usually reserved for men) but sometimes total exclusion from monetised exchange. Female workers may constitute the lion's share of intensive low paid seasonal labour, but they are often not remunerated in cash at all: "In the past they were given cotton in exchange but now they are given slips³² which the men in their family collect from the landlord."³³ "Usually, women farmers are given slips in return for their work. However, due to the conservative nature of the society in Southern Punjab, it is the male who goes to the market to exchange it for money."³⁴

This systematic exclusion from the cash economy extends to family farms. Development specialists observed that:

"The rural women are not paid at all for their contribution in the household handling of dairy and meat animals. Sometimes, they can retain the money earned through milk sales but in majority of the cases, the male members of the family handle money matters... Similarly at farm level, they don't get paid for working for family-run farming and in case of contract farming for others, female workers are paid much less than the male counterparts."³⁵

Exclusion from monetary income and inclusion on gender specific terms also extends to asset ownership. Several interviewees identified a lack of land as a key livelihood constraint and only a handful of female farmers had land titles.³⁶ For example, "currently no land in the name of women... These rural women also get exploited by the designers when government wants to show gender awareness."³⁷ For rural women farmers, it could be a totally unfounded thing to embark on such trade without land access, capital inputs and technical expertise, these being the basic major constraints."³⁸

This sense of invisibility and particular terms of market engagement has a particular human dimension in the form of perceptions of personal safety. Deficiencies in empowerment and capacity left many women isolated in the informal agricultural sector devoid of labour protection and reliant upon informal short-term contracts.

Interviewees revealed major failings in the provision of a safe and healthy environment such as the absence of hygienic toilet facilities and the presence of chemical residues in the fields. Pesticide use is particularly high in the cotton sector, for example (Sidebottom, 2017). Female fieldworkers do not wear protective clothing and are accompanied by their children. Landlords do not ensure clean drinking water and farmers share water tanks with farm animals. Repeated contact

³¹ Conversations with the chief executive of PODA, Ms. Sameena Nazir.

³² A form of IOU.

³³ Conversations with development practitioners.

³⁴ Conversations with Naila Hussain, development practitioner working with female farmers in Pakistan.

³⁵ Conversations with I. Massod, Investment Specialist, USAID Punjab Enabling Environment Project.

³⁶ Conversations with PODA focus group.

³⁷ Interview quotes from Naila Hussain, development practitioner working with female farmers in Pakistan.

³⁸ Conversations with chief executive, Ms. Samina Nazir, PODA.

with toxic chemicals and contaminated water has resulted in severe health issues for women and their children. This greatly restricts ability to conduct farm or household chores. Informants cited the following health concerns:

“A major hazard to women working on cotton farms is to their health.”

“No safety measures are taken by the landlords, the pesticide spray used is not organic and is also not diluted before use.”

“Some of the pesticides that are banned in the developed countries and even developing ones like Sri Lanka and Malaysia are in frequent use in the fields.”

The issue of health and safety also has a personal security dimension which has important implications for occupational mobility, labour productivity and employability. One interviewee told us: “I need farmers to also do night duty when they have to give water in the fields at night. Women cannot do night duty. There are safety issues.”³⁹

This finding was not isolated to poor female farmers. We witnessed similar safety concerns throughout our research across all social strata, from the lowest rung of the invisible worker to formal textile employees and educated entrepreneurs.

These concerns manifest themselves in something as simple as transport. In order to market their produce and get access to credit and training, women need safe (harassment free) transport. Our findings confirm those of Shahbaz et al., (2010)—female occupational mobility remains constricted due the lack of safe transport.

Conversations with development practitioners revealed, “Transport is very important especially for establishing market linkages. Currently, far flung villages in South Punjab are connected only by a few Suzuki vans passing by a few times a week. They don’t have space for women as such. Bearing in mind that South Punjab is even more conservative than North and Central Punjab, such transport limitations really restrict women’s mobility.”⁴⁰

One speaker during our focus group added, “it’s the women who either due to child care responsibilities or lack of safe transport, get left behind.”⁴¹ In contrast, “men just get on the bikes and go!”⁴²

Textiles and Clothing

When we extended our research to the manufacturing sector, we found similar recurring themes. These reinforced our core finding that the parameters for exclusion and inclusion were not unique to a particular sector, location or income or class boundaries.

Survey responses from Pakistani textile workers’ perceptions echoed quantitative research of actual outcomes from other countries. They felt that the benefits of more liberalised trade were unlikely to be the same for male and female employees. Even if female workers were offered more formal contracts and better pay in absolute terms, their relative positions at work (and in the household) may worsen. They feared that increased export volumes may simply translate into higher wages for skilled (male) workers but create greater demands and worse conditions for lower skilled (predominantly female) workers.

Interestingly, perceptions of gender inequalities were not gender specific. Both male and female workers also indicated that there was little protection for the female worker with sexual harassment identified as an important concern.

³⁹ Conversation with one of the few farmers in Pakistan, Ms. Rabia Sultan.

⁴⁰ Conversations with Naila Hussain, development practitioner, Pakistan.

⁴¹ Focus group at PODA.

⁴² Conversations with chief executive, Ms. Samina Nazir, PODA.

Although men also experienced problems with respect to collective bargaining, for example, these were particularly apparent for female workers:

“Women are always at the weaker end, they can’t negotiate much, without support. Unless government ensures minimum wage...women can negotiate, but they have no room for it since supervisor looks at the landlord’s benefit and women can be easily replaced. Landlords don’t let men form unions and can lay them off for any such move, so women don’t even think about it.”⁴³

Some attributed the gender earnings gap to a number of practical and social obstacles to female participation in particular tasks. For example, shift work may be problematic if women need to care for families or have concerns regarding safety due to the absence of safe transport or working conditions at night:

“There are industry-specific issues such as spinning units usually operate in 3 shifts and women can’t work late hours or late shifts. For this, a safe environment needs to be maintained through strict laws so women feel comfortable working and their families feel comfortable sending them for work.”⁴⁴

There was also a human capital dimension that derived in part from social stereotyping. In line with Hassan (2010), female workers reported a systematic lack of specialised training in areas such as accounting, stitching and spinning⁴⁵

“Our workers, especially women workers are not experienced enough to stitch according to the international market standards. It is well known that women can do a better job than men in stitching, but lack of training and skills have hindered their involvement in textile and clothing production units...Skills enhancement by setting up institutions and training centres around big cities. And provide transportation facilities so that trainees can attain training.”⁴⁶

It was not that women did not have the capacity or willingness themselves to complete the training but that they were not being given the same opportunities as men by their employers to upgrade their skills. As such, obstacles to participation in the potential benefits of more trade were manifest in terms of capacity building as well as capacity utilisation.

Entrepreneurs

We witnessed similar perceptions of perceived gender norms amongst entrepreneurs at the LCCI. Through interviewees, surveys and secondary data, we found that obstacles to female participation in regional trade had deep social and institutional roots.

Many female entrepreneurs shared the same concerns as their male counterparts. For example, several sought more assistance from the foreign office of Pakistan in connecting them

⁴³ Focus group at PODA.

⁴⁴ Conversations with APTMA Secretary General Mr. Anis ul Haq.

⁴⁵ They also confirmed a severe lack of training in garments, fashion and marketing.

⁴⁶ Conversations with APTMA Secretary General Anis ul Haq.

with the pertinent business community in the world of regional trade^{47 48}: “The support I would require is networking. Networking with Commercial Counsellors in Islamabad and delegations to targeted countries.”⁴⁹

However, our interviewees also revealed an underlying barrier of perceived social acceptability regarding female entrepreneurship. As we found in agriculture, female entrepreneurs felt that they remained largely invisible in the context of government policies such that both their general and specific needs were not being addressed. One commented: “More than capital requirements, it was being accepted as a woman entrepreneur in this field that took many, many years.”⁵⁰

Such sentiments resonate with the work of Finnegan (2003) and confirm a current widespread institutional failure to address the specific needs of women entrepreneurs in terms of access to business support services, credit and membership associations. Some interviewees therefore suggested the need for specific female capacity building initiatives and access to senior mentors with sectoral expertise⁵¹. These included assistance at exhibitions and with marketing as well as measures to help combat fraudulent products and ensure better provision of credit for female entrepreneurs.

In particular one interviewee noted the requirement for “specific support for female entrepreneurs at police stations in Pakistan (in case of complaints regarding business misconduct, exploitation, misdealing’s from business stakeholders, asset ownership, harassment).”⁵²

Most interestingly, female entrepreneurs shared many of the same concerns as female workers. They too identified the provision of safe and comfortable transportation as a key factor with some expressing a strong preference for transport facilities exclusively for women⁵³.

This reiterates our key finding: across our surveys, interviewees and focus groups, from the invisible farmer to the factory worker and the high-end entrepreneur, the degree to which all experience many of the same structural barriers to building and utilising their capabilities was strongly evident. This contrasts with preconceived policy notions that the perceptions of the more educated; economically active; or entrepreneurial are necessarily different.

That these broad perceptions that the likely trade impacts in Pakistan reflect the reality of economic upgrading and social downgrading in other countries (Tran-Nguyen and Zampetti, 2004; Klein et al., 2013; Milberg, 2013; Shepherd, B. and S. Stone. 2017) is an important finding. The fact that these economic dynamics are overlaid upon the complex social milieu in Pakistan is widely seen as exacerbating, not improving pre-existing stark issues of gender inequality.

Our findings therefore confirm the need to explicitly incorporate gender dimensions within trade policy (WEF, 2016) but also suggest its limitations. The pervasive actual and perceived social and institutional factors that underpin this gender bias stretch well beyond trade. There is a need

⁴⁷ Conversations with Ms. Michelle Tanwir Ahmed, Deputy Secretary, Standing Committee Section, Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

⁴⁸ Conversations with Ms. Fatima Ali Khan, Deputy Secretary, Standing Committee Section, Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

⁴⁹ Conversations with one of most well-established female entrepreneurs in Pakistan, Ms. Huma Fakhar, a rice exporter.

⁵⁰ Conversations with Ms. Huma Fakhar.

⁵¹ Conversations Mr. Alymas Hyder president, Lahore Chamber of commerce and Industry.

⁵² Conversations with Ms. Meherunissa Ahemd, Deputy Secretary, Standing Committee Section, Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

⁵³ Conversations with Ms. Meherunissa Ahemd, Deputy Secretary, Standing Committee Section, Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

for policy initiatives to explicitly recognise gender specific obstacles to livelihood improvement in general, not just through trade. Such measures therefore need to be cross-sectoral, rather than piecemeal and recognise that even those women who do have greater capabilities, often feel unable or unwilling to utilise them effectively. This is a twin problem of capacity building as well as capacity utilisation.

This implies the need for tailored training programmes in agriculture, for example, through the provision of female (only) farmer schools to allow for unique time constraints, child support requirements and gendered burdens female farmers face (Chayal et al., 2010). Measures to improved access to credit need to include effective female control of how funds are spent. In turn this access could be facilitated by a more equitable distribution of land (or other assets) through joint ownership, for example.

To address the negative effects of trade liberalisation and provide equal opportunities to benefit from it may have to be supplemented with active positive discrimination through the provision of specific public services for women. Such measures might include reserved female seating on public transport as well as active government assistance in the promotion of products in which women may have a local or regional competitive niche, such as *maroundi*, *sarson ka saag*, *makie ki roti*⁵⁴. These schemes may improve female perceptions of their own opportunities and therefore form part of a portfolio of active ‘push’ mechanisms to encourage more women to engage in regional trade but need to be matched by ‘pull’ mechanisms to facilitate expansion of female businesses (Finnegan, 2003).

However, this is not just a question of legal technicalities and capacity but one of social and institutional inertia. Effective gender mainstreaming requires not only a synchronisation between international and national legislation but strong institutional, social and political commitment to radically shift the rules of the game and to reduce the ‘translation gap’ between statute and enforcement (UNCTAD, 2016). More effective enforcement of laws on sexual harassment, for example, needs to be supplemented by more visible governance from below via more meaningful female participation in the workplace and society as a whole.

Conclusion

Our research supplements the literature on the impact of trade on female employment by furthering our understanding of the specific mechanisms by which individual workers think that these outcomes may occur. Through a qualitative assessment of the perceptions of various stakeholders, we highlight the importance and commonality of hidden issues for women as they see them (such as personal safety and transport) across ‘visible’ formal and ‘invisible’ informal sectors.

Our key finding is the prevalence of systematic obstacles to female employment and entrepreneurial opportunities in Pakistan across the segments of the socioeconomic spectrum that we studied. Our interviewees consistently relayed their concerns that increased international trade and economic upgrading cannot be viewed as synonymous with inclusive economic development or social upgrading, particularly across gender boundaries.

These concerns indicate actual and perceived barriers to capacity building as well as its effective utilisation. Even if females can acquire skills through more inclusive training programmes, they do not perceive that they will benefit equally from employment and

⁵⁴ Local specialties, ideas taken from PODA focus group.

entrepreneurial opportunities resulting from trade liberalisation. These perceptions in turn may acutely limit female labour force participation in a self-fulfilling cycle.

Trade liberalisation can indeed be a catalyst for female employment and empowerment but only in so much as it facilitates the transition of females from invisible to visible economic participation. This can only be achieved through a multi-pronged approach to address specific socioeconomic gender dimensions of actual and perceived impediments to female economic participation.

There are (at least) two major prerequisites for these initiatives. The first is the collation and monitoring of gender-disaggregated employment, sector and trade data that addresses the 'invisibility' of female entrepreneurship and informal employment to ensure appropriate policy design and impact evaluation. The second is the need for a comprehensive re-evaluation of social attitudes towards gender stereotyping, meaningful female participation in collective bargaining and of female rights to parity with regards to pay and training. Each presents obvious but not insurmountable challenges. Recognition of these issues is, however, an essential starting point. It is in this vein that this paper contributes.

Bibliography

- ADB (2000) 'Country Briefing Paper, Women in Pakistan. ADB, Programs Department (West) and Office of Environment and Social Development.
- Alesina A and D. Rodrick D (1994). "Distributive politics and economic growth". *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*. MIT Press. Vol. 109(2): 465–490.
- Asian Development Bank Institute. Available: <https://www.adb.org/publications/trade-andwomen>
- Balioune-Lutz, M Globalisation and Gender Inequality: Is Africa Different? *Journal of African Economies*, Vol. 16, No. 2, pp. 301-348, 2007.
- Begum, R. and G. Yasmeen. 2011. Contribution of Pakistani women in agriculture: productivity and constraints. *Sarhad J. Agric.* 27:637-643.
- Berik, G. (2009). Gender Aspects of Trade. [online] <http://www.oit.org>. Available at: http://www.oit.org/wcm5/groups/public/---ed_emp/documents/presentation/wcm_041816.pdf
- Bohnet, Iris (2016) *What works; gender equality by design*. Harvard university press.
- Boserup, Ester (1970). *Woman's role in economic development*. London: George Allen & Unwin. Reprinted as: Boserup, Ester (2007). *Woman's role in economic development*. London Sterling, Virginia: Earthscan.
- Caraway, T. (2007). *Assembling women*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Cevik, Serhan, Ferhan, Salman, Robert Tchaidze, Andreas Tudyka, Yi Liu, Maria Orihuela-Quintanilla, and Hiba Zaidi. *Pakistan Selected Issues*. Rep. N.p.: International Monetary Fund, 2015. Print. Pg. 30-36.
- Chang R., Kaltani L. and Loayza, N.V. (2009), "Openness can be good for growth: the role of policy complementarities". *Journal of Development Economics*, 90, p. 33-49.
- Chayal, K., B. L. Dkaka and R. L. Suwika. 2010. Analysis of role performed by women in Agri. *J. Hum. Soc. Sci.* 5:68-72.
- Cuberes, D., and M. Teignier, 2014, "Aggregate Costs of Gender Gaps in the Labor Market: A Quantitative Estimate," Working Paper, No. 2014/308 (New York: University of Buffalo).
- Dasgupta, Nilanjana, and Shaki Asgari. "Seeing is believing: Exposure to counter stereotypic women leaders and its effect on the malleability of automatic gender stereotyping." *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 40.5 (2004): 642-658.
- Dollar, D. (1992). 'Outward-oriented developing countries really do grow more rapidly: evidence from 95 LDCs, 1976–85', *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, vol. 40(3), (April), pp. 523–44.
- Dollar, D. and Kraay, A. (2004), "Trade, Growth, and Poverty". *The Economic Journal*, 114, February, p. 22-49.
- Eisenhardt, K.M. "Building Theories from Case Study Research," *Academy of Management Review* (14:4), 1989, pp. 532-550.
- Elson, Diane (1995). *Male bias in the development process (contemporary issues in development studies)*. Manchester New York New York: Manchester University Press (USA and Canada – St. Martin's Press).
- European Commission. (2016). *Pakistan - Trade - European Commission*. [online] [Ec.europa.eu](http://ec.europa.eu). Available at: <http://ec.europa.eu/trade/policy/countries-and-regions/countries/pakistan/>
- Food and Agriculture Organization. (2015). *Women in agriculture in Pakistan*. [online] <http://www.fao.org/>. Available at: <http://www.fao.org/3/a-i4330e.pdf>
- G. Reis, J., Taglioni, D., Kunaka, C. and Pitigala, N. (2013). *Reinvigorating the Agenda for Open Trade*. [online] <http://documents.worldbank.org/>. Available at: <http://www->

- wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2013/07/17/000442464_20130717122231/Rendered/PDF/795590BRI0SASE0Box0377381B00PUBLIC0.pdf
- Garlaschelli, E., and M.I. Loffredo. 2004. "Wealth Dynamics on Complex Networks." *Physica A* 338 (1–2): 113–118.
- Gereffi, G A global value chain perspective on Industrial policy and development in Emerging markets. *Duke Journal of Comparative and International Law* (Vol 24:433)
- Gonzales, C., Jain-Chandra, S., Kochhar, K. and Newiak, M. (2015). Fair Play: More Equal Laws Boost Female Labor Force Participation. [online] International Monetary Fund (IMF). Available at: <https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/sdn/2015/sdn1502.pdf>
- H Mumtaz, A. (2015). Women in the workforce. [online] E.thenews.com.pk. Available at: http://e.thenews.com.pk/newsmag/mag/detail_article.asp?id=7740&magId=10
- Habib, N. (1996) : Invisible farmers in Pakistan: a study on the role of women in agriculture and the impact of pesticides on them. Khoj, Research and Publication Centre
- Haq, Ehsan Ul. (2009). Current Status and Prospects Of Female Employment In The Apparel Industry In Pakistan. [online] ResearchGate. Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265491254_Current_status_and_prospects_of_female_employment_in_the_apparel_industry_in_Pakistan
- Hargreaves, J.R., Morison, L.A., Gear, J.S.S., Makhubele, M.B., Porter, J.D.H., Busza, J., Watts, C., Kim, J.C., & Pronyk, P.M., 2007, "Hearing the voices of the poor": Assigning Poverty lines on the basis of local perceptions of poverty: A Quantitative analysis of qualitative data from participatory wealth ranking in rural South Africa, *World Development* Vol 35 No 2 pp 212-229.
- Hassan, M. 2010. Gender mainstreaming in agricultural extension: analysis and obstacles to gender mainstreaming in Agriculture Extension: a case study of district Muzaffargarh, Pakistan. VDM. Verlag Dr. Müller GmbH & Co. KG Publisher, Germany.
- Howe, G. & McKay, A., 2007, Combing Quantitative and Qualitative methods in assessing chronic poverty: the case of Rwanda, *World Development* Vol 35, No 2, pp 197-211.
- ILO Country Office for Pakistan, (2013). Pakistan Labour Market Update. [online]. International Labour Organization. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---ilo-islamabad/documents/publication/wcms_222834.pdf
- International Labour Organization. (2016). ILO. [online] Ilo.org. Available at: <http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/lang--en/index.htm>
- International Labour Organization. (2016). Women at Work Trends 2016. [online] ilo.org. Available at: http://www.ilo.org/gender/Informationresources/Publications/WCMS_457317/lang--en/index.htm
- International Labour Organization. (2016). Women at Work. [online] <http://www.ilo.org/>
- International Trade Centre, 2018, <https://www.trademap.org/>
- Jhabvala, Renana (2003) "Globalization, Liberalization and Women in the Informal Economy" in Veena Jha (ed) *Trade, Globalisation, and Gender: Evidence from South Asia*, UNIFEM in collaboration with UNCTAD, New Delhi.
- Khan, A. (2007) 'Women and Paid Work in Pakistan'. Karachi: Collective of Social Science Research.
- Khattak, Saba. 2001. "Women, Work and Empowerment," in Asad Sayeed and Saba Gul Khattak, eds. *Women's Work and Empowerment Issues in an Era of Economic Liberalization: A Case Study of Pakistan's Urban Manufacturing Sector*. Islamabad: Pakistan Institute of

- Labor Education & Research (PILER) and Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI). 65-87.
- Klein M. W., C. Moser, and D. M. Urban. 2013. Exporting, Skills and Wage Inequality. *Labour Economics* 25: 76–85.
- Kucera, D. and Tejani, S. (2014). Feminization, Defeminization, and Structural Change in Manufacturing. *World Development*, 64, pp.569-582.
- MacLaren, Barb. 2012. “Free Trade Agreements in Peru and Colombia: Monitoring Future Impacts from a Gender Perspective.” Ottawa: The North-South Institute. <http://www.nsi-ins.ca/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/2012-Monitoring-Future-FTAImpacts-from-a-Gender-Perspective.pdf>.
- Makino, Momoe. (2012). What Motivates Female Operators to Enter the Garment Industry in Pakistan in the Post-MFA Period. Rep. Institute Of Developing Economies. Available at: https://ir.ide.go.jp/dspace/bitstream/2344/1193/1/ARRIDE_Discussion_No.374_makino.pdf
- Milberg, W and Winkler, D (2013) *Outsourcing Economics: Global Value Chains in Capitalist Development*, Cambridge University Press.
- Ministry of Commerce, Government of Pakistan. (2015). STRATEGIC TRADE POLICY FRAMEWORK 2012-2015. <http://www.commerce.gov.pk/>. [online] Available at: http://www.commerce.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/STRATEGIC_TRADE_POLICY_FRAMEWORK_2012-15.pdf [Accessed 23 Mar. 2016].
- Ministry of Finance, (2013). Pakistan Economic Survey 2012-13. Pakistan Economic Survey. [online] Islamabad: Government of Pakistan. Available at: http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey_1213.html
- Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan. (2015) Pakistan Economic Survey 2014-15. [online] <http://www.finance.gov.pk/>. Available at: http://www.finance.gov.pk/survey/chapters_15/Highlights.pdf
- Ministry of Science & Technology (MOITT, (2000). IT Policy and Action Plan. [online] Government of Pakistan. Available at: <http://www.moitt.gov.pk/gop/index.php?q=aHR0cDovLzE5Mi4xNjguNzAuMTM2L21v aXQvdXNlcmZpbGVzMS9maWxlL3BvbGljaWVzL1Bha2lzdGFuJTIwSVQlMjBQb2xp Y3klMjAlMjBBY3Rpb24lMjBQbGFuJTIwMjAwMC5wZGY%3D>
- Mumtaz, Z. and Salway, S., (2005), I never go anywhere: extricating the links between women’s mobility and uptake of reproductive health services in Pakistan, *Journal of Social Science and Medicine*. 60 (2005), 1751-1765.
- Osakwe, E. (2009). Cotton Fact Sheet Pakistan. [online] International Cotton Advisory Committee (ICAC). Available at: https://www.icac.org/econ_stats/country_facts/e_pakistan.pdf
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. (2013). Pakistan Employment Trends 2013. [online] <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/>. Available at: http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/Labour%20Force/publications/Pakistan_Employment_2013.pdf
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. (2014). Percentage Distribution Of Employees By Wage Groups, Major Industry Division And Sex 2013-14. [online] <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/>. Available at: <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files//Labour%20Force/publications/lfs2013-14/t42-pak-fin.pdf>
- Piler (2014) Towards a Sustainable Textile Supply Chain in Pakistan, working paper, 2014.

- PITAD. (2016). Pakistan Institute of Trade And Development. [online] Pitad.org.pk. Available at: <http://www.pitad.org.pk/indexP.php?type=research-portfolios>
- Plaisier, I., J.G.M. de Bruijn, R. de-Graaf, M. T. Have, T.F. Beekman and W.J.H. Penninx. 2007. The contribution of working conditions and social support to the onset of depressive and anxiety disorders among male and female employees. *Soc. Sci. Med.* 64:401-410.
- Randriamaro, Z. (2006). Gender and Trade: Overview Report), , Brighton, United Kingdom: BRIDGE, Institute of Development Studies (IDS), University of Sussex, BRIDGE Cutting Edge Pack.
- Riaz, A., S. Muhammad, I. Ashraf and M.I. Zafar. 2012. Role of Punjab rural support program in improving economic conditions of rural women through micro financing. *Pak. J. Agri. Sci.* 49:211-216.
- Rodrick, D (2007) One economics, Many recipes. Globalization, institutions and economic growth. Princeton university press, ISBN 0-691-12951-7.
- Sachs, J.D. and Warner, A. (1995). 'Economic reform and the process of global integration', *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity*, no. 1, pp. 1–118.
- Sadaf, S., S. Muhammad and T. E. Lodhi. 2005. Need for agricultural extension services for rural women in tehsil Faisalabad–Pakistan. *J. Agri. Soc. Sci.* 1:248-251.
- Sathar, Z., N. Crook, C. Callum, S. Kazi. (1988) 'Women's Status and Fertility Change in Pakistan' *Population and Development Review*, 14(3): 415-432.
- Shafiq Ur Rehman, M. (2013). Pakistan Cotton and Products Annual 2013. [online] <http://gain.fas.usda.gov/>. Available at: http://gain.fas.usda.gov/Recent%20GAIN%20Publications/Cotton%20and%20Products%20Annual_Islamabad_Pakistan_4-2-2013.pdf
- Shahbaz, B., T. Ali, I. A. Khan, and M. Ahmad. 2010. An analysis of the problems faced by farmers in the mountains of Northwest Pakistan: challenges for agri. extension. *Pak. J. Agri. Sci.* 47:415-418.
- Shaheed, Farida, and Khawar Mumtaz, 1981, Invisible Workers - Piecework labour amongst women in Lahore. Islamabad, Women's Division of the Government of Pakistan.
- Shepherd, B. and S. Stone. 2017. Trade and Women. ADBI Working Paper 648. Tokyo: Japan
- Siegmann, Karin Astrid and Hadia Majid, (2014) Empowering growth in Pakistan? Institute of Social Studies, The Hague, The Netherlands.
- Siegmann, Karin Astrid. (2004). Prospects for Women Textile and Clothing Workers in the Post-quota Era. [online] Available at: Sdpi.org
- Siddique, A., Z. Batool, S. Anwar and M. Farooq. 2009. An assessment of female participation in income generating activities in agriculture sector in rural of District Sialkot. *J. Animal Plant Sci.* 19:230-233.
- Sidebottom, R.I., 2017, Market framing of Development in the Cotton Textile and Apparel sector in Sub-Saharan Africa, PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 2017.
- Sohail, Zohra. (2014). FEMALE OCCUPATIONAL CHOICE: DETERMINANTS & CONSTRAINTS. Institute of Development and Economic Alternatives. Available at: <http://ideaspak.org/female-occupational-choice-in-pakistan-determinants-constraints/>
- State Bank of Pakistan (SBP) (2013) Annual Report 2011-2012. The State of Pakistan's Economy. Karachi: State Bank of Pakistan. Available at: <http://www.sbp.org.pk/reports/annual/arFY12/complete.pdf>

- Tahir, S. & Anwar, T. *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol* (2012), Assessment of Pesticide Exposure in Female Population Living in Cotton Growing Areas of Punjab, Pakistan, 89: 1138. doi:10.1007/s00128-012-0857-7
- Tanwir, M and Safdar, T., (2013). The Rural Woman's Constraints to Participation in Rural Organizations. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 14(3), 210-229.
- Tran-Nguyen, A. and Beviglia Zampetti, A. (2004). Trade and Gender Opportunities and Challenges for Developing Countries. [online] UNCTAD. Available at: http://unctad.org/en/docs/edm20042_en.pdf
- Tran-Nguyen, A., & Zampetti, A. B. (Eds.). (2004). Trade and gender: Opportunities and challenges for developing countries. New York and Geneva.
- UNCTAD (2009). Mainstreaming gender in trade policy. Note by the UNCTAD secretariat. TD/B/C.I/EM.2/2/Rev.1, http://www.unctad.org/en/docs/ciem2d2_en.pdf
- UNCTAD (2010). Trade and Development Report, 2010, <http://www.unctad.org/Templates/WebFlyer.asp?intItemID=5608&lang=1>
- UNCTAD (2016) Trade, gender and development. Advocating inclusive and gender-sensitive economic development on a global level. http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/ditcmisc2016d6_en.pdf
- UNDP (2016). "Empowering Women through Skill Generation in the Garments Industry." UNDP Pakistan. Available at: http://www.pk.undp.org/content/pakistan/en/home/ourwork/povertyreduction/successstories/Sample_Success_Story_1.html
- United nations (2011) Women Watch, Gender Equality & Trade Policy, Resource Paper, 2011, United Nations Inter-Agency Network on Women and Gender Equality (IANWGE), <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/>
- Viiilup, E. (2016). The EU's Trade Policy: from gender-blind to gender-sensitive?. [online] European Parliament. Available at: [http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/IDAN/2015/549058/EXPO_IDA\(2015\)549058_EN.pdf](http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/IDAN/2015/549058/EXPO_IDA(2015)549058_EN.pdf)
- Wamboye, E.F. & Stephanie Seguino, S., (2014) Gender Effects of Trade Openness in Sub-Saharan Africa, *Feminist Economics*, 21:3, 82-113, DOI: 10.1080/13545701.2014.927583
- World Bank Group Enterprise Surveys. (2013). Business Environment in Pakistan - World Bank Enterprise Survey of Business Managers - World Bank Group. [online] enterprisesurveys.org Available at: <https://www.enterprisesurveys.org/data/exploreconomies/2013/pakistan> [Accessed 23 Mar. 2016].
- World Bank Group. (2016). World Bank Group. [online] Available at: <http://www.worldbank.org/>
- World Bank. 2015. World Bank Group gender strategy (FY16-23): gender equality, poverty reduction and inclusive growth. Washington, D.C.: World Bank Group. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2015/12/25691813/world-bank-group-gender-strategy-fy16-23-gender-equality-poverty-reduction-inclusive-growth>
- WTO. (2015). TRADE POLICY REVIEW. [online] <https://www.wto.org/>. Available at: https://www.wto.org/english/tratop_e/tpr_e/g311_e.pdf

Appendix

List of Interviewees

- 1) Mr. Chaudhry Shaukat, General Secretary, Pakistan Workers Confederation
- 2) Mr. Philipp Kauppert, Resident Director, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
- 3) Mr. Abdul Qadir, Programme Coordinator and Advisor, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung
- 4) Ms. Rabia Sultan, Director, Farmers Association
- 5) Ms. Huma Fakhar, Rice Exporter and Member of Nestle Board
- 6) Ms. Sameena Nazir, Head Of PODA
- 7) Ms. Grace and focus group (team), employees of PODA
- 8) Ms. Naila Hussain, Development Practitioner
- 9) Ms. Jahan Ara, President PASHA
- 10) Mr. Jazib Zahir, Chief Operations Officer, Tint-ash
- 11) Ms. Maliha Naveed, IT professional and Technical Writer, Seamless Distribution
- 12) Mr. Omer Malik, General Manager of Foods, Pepsi Co
- 13) Mr. Zahid Saleem, Head of Agro, Pepsi Co
- 14) Mr. Khurran Shah, Corporate Affairs Manager, Pepsi Co
- 15) Mr. Farham Ahmed, Director of HR, Pepsi Co
- 16) Mr. Khurram Hussain, IT Entrepreneur
- 17) Mrs. Nilofer Shahid, Designer and Exporter, Mehraas Limited
- 18) Mr. Hassan Ibrahim, Owner of Origins and Textile Plant
- 19) Mr. Alamgir Tareen, Bottler, Pepsi, Multan Plant
- 20) Mr. Imran Masood Chaudhry, USAID Punjab Enabling Environment Project
- 21) Mr. Anis-ul-Haq, Secretary General APTMA (All Pakistan Textile Mills Association)
- 22) Mr. Asif Combh, Head of HR and Admin, Kohinoor Textiles
- 23) Ms. Rihanna Shehbaz, Sewing Machine Operator, Stitching, Kohinoor Textiles
- 24) Ms. Razia Bibi, Quality Check, Kohinoor Textiles
- 25) Ms. Amina Kamal, Helper Clipping, Kohinoor Textiles
- 26) Ms. Noor Hassan, Folding/trimming, Kohinoor Textiles
- 27) Ms. Zainab Bashir, Folding/trimming, Kohinoor Textiles
- 28) Ms. Anam Malik, Designing, Processing, Kohinoor Textiles
- 29) Mr. Ali Hussain, Sewing Machine Operator, Stitching, Kohinoor Textiles
- 30) Mr. Mohammad Irfan, Sewing Machine Operator, Stitching, Kohinoor Textiles
- 31) Ms. Hira Batool Rizvi, Co-Founder, Strategist, Shekab
- 32) Mr. Salman Sufi, Women's Department, Chief Minister Office, Lahore
- 33) Ms. Hafsa Malik, Research Associate, Chief Minister Office, Lahore

Some of the workers interviewed in factories have not been named as they requested privacy. Questionnaires assessed 600 entrepreneurs registered with Lahore Chamber of Commerce and Industry.

Questions for Agriculture Workers:

- Semi structured interviews, open ended questions
- 1) Where are the female workers in agriculture?
 - 2) What are their major issues female workers face in the production and export of rice and cotton?

- 3) How wide is the wage gap between female and male workers? How can we minimize the wage gap?
- 4) What can the government do specifically to empower the female farmer? (positive discrimination?)
- 5) On a scale of 1 to 10 which of the following can empower the female worker in agriculture?
 - access to finances
 - access to inputs and fertilizer
 - access to transport
 - crèches
 - women friendly inheritance laws
 - toilets
 - female extension services focusing on latest farming practices
 - trainings on using mechanical equipment
 - free distribution of tools, machines or their availability at subsidized rates for women
 - skills enhancement
 - Education about basic and easy-to-grasp monetary, financial, and measuring concepts to make them take an effective part in the dealing process as well as the wage-negotiating process.
 - For agricultural workers hired to work on seasonal basis for specific tasks, a standardized and labor-friendly wage system,
 - flexible hours of work
 - Land reforms, land entitlements
 - Promotion of agriculture market committees for women
 - extending labour rights of the formal sector workers to the workers of the informal sector
 - Women organizing self-help groups and female trade unions

Any other insights which would support the female farmer and exporter to participate in regional trade.

Do women have market linkages where they can sell their produce?

Any other comments:

Questions for Textile and Clothing Workers:

- Semi structured interviews, open ended questions.
- Start with general background. Position. Product. Output.
- If interviewing head of organization or entrepreneur, mention caste capitalism, power networks, social capital, and specific government institutional support that can be a catalyst for their participation in regional trade.
- Probe questions: focus on increasing exports and analyse the primary constraints for female workers in terms of participating in producing goods that connect to regional trade.
- On a scale of 1 to 10, please give weightage of the following which will incentivize your participation in regional trade. In open ended questions, please add comment.
 - 1) Removing gaps by provision of training? 1-10
 - 2) If yes, please specify training required.
 - 3) If you have had any previous trainings, were they gender sensitive or not?

- 4) The importance of minimizing the wage gap? 1-10
- 5) How can your working environment be improved?
- 6) Do men have an advantage over women in working for T and C? 1-10
- 7) If yes, how?
- 8) How can women get a level playing field?
- 9) Stricter harassment laws? 1-10
- 10) Provision of formal contracts? 1-10
- 11) Provision of child care (Crèches)? 1-10
- 12) Provision of safe and reliable transport? 1-10
- 13) Quotas for women in managerial positions? 1-10
- 14) Do you require a stronger presence in trade unions? 1-10
- 15) Women organizing self-help groups? 1-10

Questions for IT Workers:

- 1) Tell me about setting up your firm? Did you get support from your family? Do the daughters in your family have equal access to the shares and support?
- 2) Are family connection and support crucial in establishing business that exports products?
- 3) What were the major barriers in setting up your firm?
- 4) Do you hire female workers in your firm? Or practice affirmative action? Or, is it more convenient to have men? Are there specific jobs that women could do better such as HR and finance?
- 5) What issue do they face?
- 6) How can IT serve women and regional trade? How do we link more women and women led businesses. What measures would help?
- 7) How can the government help to further strengthen your role in IT in regional trade?
- 8) What were the legal/institutional barriers you faced when exporting IT?
- 9) On a scale of 1 to 10, which of the following factors can assist women in participating in the export of IT regional trade? Please score.
- 10) Quotas in public contracts for women? 1-10
- 11) Strengthening of women's presence on boards (public and private)? 1-10
- 12) Government policy on Software Technology Parks (STPs) and tax incentives (Like India)? 1-10
- 13) Higher salary? 1-10
- 14) Ease in international mobility? 1-10
- 15) Gender-neutral hiring policy focused on knowledge and skills? 1-10
- 16) Flexible work hours? 1-10
- 17) Paternity leave/day care centres? 1-10
- 18) Work from home allowance? 1-10
- 19) IT training/skill development? 1-10
- 20) Access to markets and information? 1-10
- 21) Inclusion in power networks/old boys club? 1-10
- 22) Quotas for women in public and private IT related organizations? 1-10
- 23) Internship programs/training programs in IT leading to permanent jobs? 1-10
- 24) Women IT centers/incubation centers in colleges and universities? 1-10
- 25) Fiscal concessions and/or priority lending for organizations employing a high percentage of women in senior managerial positions? 1-10

- 26) Access to finances? 1-10
- 27) Access to a mentor? 1-10
- 28) Strict harassment laws in ministries and offices? 1-10
- 29) Support from the foreign office, special quotas for female exporters? 1-10
- 30) Easier ways of funds transfers? Financial access in other ways? 1-10
- 31) What is your opinion of the government's regulatory set up for promoting IT exports especially in the region? Is India a major source of competition?
- 32) Do you know about GSP Plus? Have you tried to export to the EU by taking advantage of Pakistan's GSP Plus? How would you ensure that the government continues to enjoy GSP Plus status with the EU?
- 33) What would be the important steps you'd suggest to increase the presence of other women in the IT sector as employees in firms that deal with IT exports and as entrepreneurs?
- 34) Why are the export promotion shows and bureaus as well as women's chambers not effective? Are the mainstream chambers of commerce comparatively more effective?

Specifically for Entrepreneurs:

- 1) The probe questions touched on special discounts at expo and exhibitions centres for setting up stalls; special unit in all chambers to only facilitate female entrepreneurs; special and aggressive marketing of their products by TDAP, Ministry of Commerce, SMEDA Chambers and Women Department Division; special display centres only for the products of female entrepreneurs in chambers, government departments, embassies; allocation of a certain percentage of bank credit portfolios for Women entrepreneurs; women specific subsidies/discount; Less strict collateral policy for women entrepreneurs; less strict collateral policy for women entrepreneurs; Provide support in ensuring ease in online payments (PayPal) for increasing your participation in regional trade; specific support for females' entrepreneurs at police stations in Pakistan and in regional stations; support from the government on the authenticity of products so as to prevent the labelling of fraudulent behaviour by third party sources.